

CAS simplification comparison between Maple and Mathematica

Nasser M. Abbasi

May 10, 2012

Compiled on January 1, 2019 at 9:33pm

Contents

1	introduction	1
1.1	links to older version using Maple 11 and Mathematica 5.2	1
1.2	updated results using Maple 14 and Mathematica 8.04	2
2	results	3
2.1	Mathematica	3
2.1.1	using Simplify[]	3
2.1.2	using FullSimplify[]	4
2.2	Maple	5
2.2.1	using LeafCount()	5
2.2.2	using length()	6
3	side-by-side	6

1 introduction

1.1 links to older version using Maple 11 and Mathematica 5.2

A detailed but older version that used Maple 11 and Mathematica 5.2 is here which contains images to each expression used.

1.2 updated results using Maple 14 and Mathematica 8.04

This version only shows the final result using an updated version of Mathematica and Maple, but does not show each expression generated. When I have more time I hope to also show those in this updated version.

For this version I used Mathematica 8.04 and Maple 14, both on windows 7. The PC is intel i7 930 @ 2.8 Ghz with 8 GB memory

This is the result of doing a simplification measure on an expression using Maple and Mathematica using an expression posted on sci.math.symbolic by Dr Carlos.

The expression given in the original post can be found at <http://sci4um.com/about26200.html>

```
xnum = ((6-4*Sqrt[2])*Log[3-2*Sqrt[2]]+(3-2*Sqrt[2])*Log[17-12*Sqrt[2]]+32-24*Sqrt[2]);
xden = (48*Sqrt[2]-72)*(Log[Sqrt[2]+1]+Sqrt[2])/3;

x = xnum/xden;

The answer is x = 1
```

Where x is the following expression

```
In[247]:= xnum = ((6 - 4 * Sqrt[2]) * Log[3 - 2 * Sqrt[2]] + (3 - 2 * Sqrt[2]) *
Log[17 - 12 * Sqrt[2]] + 32 - 24 * Sqrt[2]) ;
xden = (48 * Sqrt[2] - 72) * (Log[Sqrt[2] + 1] + Sqrt[2]) / 3;
x = xnum / xden

Out[249]= 
$$\frac{3 \left( 32 - 24 \sqrt{2} + (3 - 2 \sqrt{2}) \operatorname{Log}[17 - 12 \sqrt{2}] + (6 - 4 \sqrt{2}) \operatorname{Log}[3 - 2 \sqrt{2}] \right)}{(-72 + 48 \sqrt{2}) (\sqrt{2} + \operatorname{Log}[1 + \sqrt{2}])}$$

```

and in expanded form

```
Out[49]= 
$$\frac{96}{(-72 + 48 \sqrt{2}) (\sqrt{2} + \operatorname{Log}[1 + \sqrt{2}])} - \frac{72 \sqrt{2}}{(-72 + 48 \sqrt{2}) (\sqrt{2} + \operatorname{Log}[1 + \sqrt{2}])} + \frac{9 \operatorname{Log}[17 - 12 \sqrt{2}]}{(-72 + 48 \sqrt{2}) (\sqrt{2} + \operatorname{Log}[1 + \sqrt{2}])} -$$


$$\frac{6 \sqrt{2} \operatorname{Log}[17 - 12 \sqrt{2}]}{(-72 + 48 \sqrt{2}) (\sqrt{2} + \operatorname{Log}[1 + \sqrt{2}])} + \frac{18 \operatorname{Log}[3 - 2 \sqrt{2}]}{(-72 + 48 \sqrt{2}) (\sqrt{2} + \operatorname{Log}[1 + \sqrt{2}])} - \frac{12 \sqrt{2} \operatorname{Log}[3 - 2 \sqrt{2}]}{(-72 + 48 \sqrt{2}) (\sqrt{2} + \operatorname{Log}[1 + \sqrt{2}])}$$

```

Using x as shown above, the function `Expand[]` in Mathematica and `expand()` in Maple are then applied to $x, x^2, x^4, x^8, x^{16}, x^{32}$, then the result is fully simplified again, and the leaf count (measure of simplification) is compared to the original expression to obtain a measure of the system simplification.

Mathematica has both `Simplify[expr]` and `FullSimplify[expr]` and Maple has `simplify(expr, size)` and `simplify(expr)`. Here, I used only the `simplify(expr, size)` since `LeafCount` was used.

The tables below show the result of using both functions in each system.

The tables show the size of the expression before and after simplification, the percentage in size reduction and the cpu time used.

2 results

2.1 Mathematica

Source code used is

```
xnum = ((6-4*Sqrt[2])*Log[3-2*Sqrt[2]]+(3-2*Sqrt[2])*Log[17-12*Sqrt[2]]+32-24*Sqrt[2]);
xden = (48*Sqrt[2]-72)*(Log[Sqrt[2]+1]+Sqrt[2])/3;
x = xnum/xden;
xtab = Expand[{x,x^2,x^4,x^8,x^16}];
n = Length[xtab];
stab = Table[0,{n},{4}];

For[i=1,i<= n,i++,
{
stab[[i,1]] = LeafCount[xtab[[i]];
s = Timing[Simplify[ xtab[[i]] ]; (*use FullSimplify or Simplify *)
stab[[i,2]] = LeafCount[ s[[2]] ];
stab[[i,3]] = s[[1]];
stab[[i,4]] = Round[100.0*stab[[i,2]]/stab[[i,1]]];
}
];

Grid[Join[{"leaf count before","leaf count after","cpu","% reduction"}],stab],
Frame->All
]
```

2.1.1 using Simplify[]

When running the above code, using `Simplify[]`, this is the result

leaf count before	leaf count after	cpu	% reduction
230	50	0.093	22
507	96	0.156	19
1394	362	0.265	26
4500	1052	0.702	23
16040	3533	2.231	22

2.1.2 using FullSimplify[]

When running the above code, using FullSimplify[], this is the result

leaf count before	leaf count after	cpu	% reduction
230	32	0.296	14
507	90	0.78	18
1394	232	888.894	17
4500	1043	65.302	23
16040	3525	393.637	22

2.2 Maple

2.2.1 using LeafCount()

In maple, using `with(MmaTranslator[Mma])` to access the function `LeafCount()`.

Source code

```

restart;
with(MmaTranslator[Mma]):
xnum := ((6-4*sqrt(2))*ln(3-2*sqrt(2))+(3-2*sqrt(2))*ln(17-12*sqrt(2))+32-24*sqrt(2)):
xden := (48*sqrt(2)-72)*(ln(sqrt(2)+1)+sqrt(2))/3:
x := xnum/xden:

n:=5:
stab := Matrix(5,4,0): #Matrix where to keep track of stats
xtab := expand({x,x^2,x^4,x^8,x^16}):

for i from 1 to n do

    stab[i,1]:= LeafCount(xtab[i]):

    startingTime := time():
    s := simplify(xtab[i],size):
    stab[i,3] := time()-startingTime:

    stab[i,2] := LeafCount(s):
    stab[i,4] := ceil(100.*stab[i,2]/stab[i,1]):

od:
stab;

```

Columns have the same meaning as above.

$$\begin{bmatrix} 180 & 62 & 0.35 \\ 399 & 114 & 0.29 \\ 1104 & 272 & 0.25 \\ 3582 & 804 & 0.23 \\ 12810 & 2732 & 0.22 \end{bmatrix}$$

2.2.2 using length()

Source code used is

```
restart;

xnum := ((6-4*sqrt(2))*ln(3-2*sqrt(2))+(3-2*sqrt(2))*ln(17-12*sqrt(2))+32-24*sqrt(2)):
xden := (48*sqrt(2)-72)*(ln(sqrt(2)+1)+sqrt(2))/3:
x := xnum/xden:

n := 5:
stab := Matrix(5,4,0): #Matrix where to keep track of stats
xtab := expand({x,x^2,x^4,x^8,x^16}):

for i from 1 to n do

  stab[i,1]:=length(xtab[i]):

  startingTime := time():
  s := simplify(xtab[i],size):
  stab[i,3] := time() - startingTime:

  stab[i,2] := length(s):
  stab[i,4] := ceil(100.*stab[i,2]/stab[i,1]):
od:

stab;
```

Columns have the same meaning as above.

$$\begin{bmatrix} 555 & 198 & 0. & 36 \\ 1245 & 372 & 0.015 & 30 \\ 3509 & 956 & 0.016 & 28 \\ 11905 & 3316 & 0.031 & 28 \\ 47654 & 14960 & 0.094 & 32 \end{bmatrix}$$

3 side-by-side

This shows Mathematica Simplify result against Maple `simplify(expr, size)` both using `LeafCount`.

Maple 14	Mathematica 8.04																								
$\begin{bmatrix} 180 & 62 & 0.35 \\ 399 & 114 & 0.29 \\ 1104 & 272 & 0.25 \\ 3582 & 804 & 0.23 \\ 12810 & 2732 & 0.22 \end{bmatrix}$	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>leaf count before</th> <th>leaf count after</th> <th>cpu</th> <th>% reduction</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>230</td> <td>50</td> <td>0.093</td> <td>22</td> </tr> <tr> <td>507</td> <td>96</td> <td>0.156</td> <td>19</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1394</td> <td>362</td> <td>0.265</td> <td>26</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4500</td> <td>1052</td> <td>0.702</td> <td>23</td> </tr> <tr> <td>16040</td> <td>3533</td> <td>2.231</td> <td>22</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	leaf count before	leaf count after	cpu	% reduction	230	50	0.093	22	507	96	0.156	19	1394	362	0.265	26	4500	1052	0.702	23	16040	3533	2.231	22
leaf count before	leaf count after	cpu	% reduction																						
230	50	0.093	22																						
507	96	0.156	19																						
1394	362	0.265	26																						
4500	1052	0.702	23																						
16040	3533	2.231	22																						

And this shows Mathematica FullSimplify result against Maple simplify(expr,size) both using LeafCount.

Maple 14	Mathematica 8.04																								
$\begin{bmatrix} 180 & 62 & 0.35 \\ 399 & 114 & 0.29 \\ 1104 & 272 & 0.25 \\ 3582 & 804 & 0.23 \\ 12810 & 2732 & 0.22 \end{bmatrix}$	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>leaf count before</th> <th>leaf count after</th> <th>cpu</th> <th>% reduction</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>230</td> <td>32</td> <td>0.296</td> <td>14</td> </tr> <tr> <td>507</td> <td>90</td> <td>0.78</td> <td>18</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1394</td> <td>232</td> <td>888.894</td> <td>17</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4500</td> <td>1043</td> <td>65.302</td> <td>23</td> </tr> <tr> <td>16040</td> <td>3525</td> <td>393.637</td> <td>22</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	leaf count before	leaf count after	cpu	% reduction	230	32	0.296	14	507	90	0.78	18	1394	232	888.894	17	4500	1043	65.302	23	16040	3525	393.637	22
leaf count before	leaf count after	cpu	% reduction																						
230	32	0.296	14																						
507	90	0.78	18																						
1394	232	888.894	17																						
4500	1043	65.302	23																						
16040	3525	393.637	22																						